

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA  
RICHMOND DIVISION**

GOLDEN BETHUNE-HILL, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

VIRGINIA STATE BOARD OF ELECTIONS,  
*et al.*,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-  
GBL-BMK

**[PROPOSED] JOINT INITIAL PRETRIAL, SCHEDULING, AND DISCOVERY  
PLAN**

Pursuant to the Court's oral instruction issued at the February 5, 2015 status conference, Plaintiffs, Defendants, and Intervenor-Defendants (collectively, the "Parties", and individually, a "Party") propose this Joint Initial Pretrial, Scheduling, and Discovery Plan.

**1. Nature of the Case**

Plaintiffs bring this action pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 1983, alleging that Virginia's House of Delegates Districts 63, 69, 70, 71, 74, 75, 77, 80, 89, 90, 92, and 95 constitute racial gerrymanders, in violation of the Equal Protection Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution. Intervenor-Defendants deny Plaintiffs' allegations. Defendants are scheduled to file their Answer on **February 18, 2015**. Dkt. No. 20.

**2. Results of Rule 26(f) Conference**

The Parties conducted a Rule 26(f) conference on February 6, 2015, during which the following topics were discussed:

**a. Related cases**

Plaintiffs believe this case is related to *Page v. Virginia State Board of Elections*, No. 3:13-cv-678, and indicated as much on their Civil Cover Sheet, Dkt. No. 1-1; this case was subsequently assigned to the same District Court Judge who presided in *Page*. Defendants disagree that *Page* is a related case.

**b. Electronically Stored Information**

All relevant information which is available on electronic storage media is discoverable, whether readily readable (“active”) or “deleted” but recoverable. In the event a Party believes producing electronically stored information will be overly burdensome or otherwise prohibitive, the Parties shall confer and seek an appropriate resolution before bringing the issue to the Court, if necessary.

**c. Privilege Issues**

Intervenor-Defendants anticipate that, depending on the course of discovery, the issue of legislative privilege may arise. Any claims of privilege that arise will be addressed by counsel, who will request that the Court enter orders by consent or by adjudication if the matters cannot be resolved by agreement.

**3. Deadlines for Joining Additional Parties**

The Parties agree that a reasonable deadline for joining additional parties is 10 days from the date of this filing.

**4. ADR Method**

The Parties believe that this case is not amenable to mediation.

**5. Discovery Plan**

**a. Rule 26(a)(1) Exchange**

The Parties shall disclose their Rule 26(a)(1) material no later than **February 20, 2015**.

**b. Expert Discovery**

Plaintiffs must serve expert report(s) no later than **March 11, 2015**, Defendants and Intervenor-Defendants must serve their expert report(s) no later than **April 10, 2015**, and Plaintiffs may serve any expert reply report(s) no later than **April 24, 2015**.

**c. Written Discovery**

The Parties agree that all written discovery shall be subject to an expedited, 10 day deadline for objections and 15-day response deadline. When necessary, the Parties will work in good faith to agree to reasonable extensions of these deadlines. Privilege logs, if necessary, shall be subject to a 21-day deadline. The number of interrogatories and requests for production each Party may serve on any other Party shall be governed by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

**d. Depositions**

The number and duration of depositions shall be governed by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 30.

**6. Discovery completion date**

The discovery cutoff shall be **May 22, 2015**.

**7. Jury trial or not**

The Parties agree that this case will be heard by the Panel and is not amenable to a jury trial.

**8. Dispositive motions**

All dispositive motions shall be filed no later than **May 28, 2015**.

**9. Motions *in Limine***

All motions *in limine* shall be filed on later than **June 5, 2015**, and heard no later than **June 26, 2015**.

**10. Written Stipulations**

Counsel for each Party shall meet and confer in a good faith effort to enter into written stipulations of uncontroverted facts no later than **June 12, 2015**. Written stipulations shall be signed by each counsel and filed with the Clerk no later than **June 26, 2015**.

**11. Discovery Designations and Summaries**

- a. No later than **June 16, 2015**, all Parties shall serve on all other counsel a list of all discovery materials, specifying the appropriate portions thereof, that the Party intends to offer at trial.
- b. No later than **June 23, 2015**, all Parties shall serve on all counsel a list of all “fairness” or rebuttal designations and amended summaries, as appropriate.
- c. No later than **June 26, 2015**, any objection to the introduction of any designation or parts thereof or any summary shall be filed by each of the Parties with the Clerk.
- d. No later than **June 29, 2015**, counsel shall confer to resolve objections to discovery designations. Any objections not resolved shall be determined at the Final Pretrial Conference.
- e. No later than **July 2, 1015**, the Party offering the designated discovery shall provide opposing counsel, the Clerk, and the Court with a conformed set of all designated discovery.

- f. No later than **July 3, 2015**, all summaries of deposition testimony to which no objection has been made shall be filed with the Clerk, with a copy delivered to the Court.

#### **12. Witness and Exhibit Lists**

- a. Plaintiff shall file a list of all witnesses intended to be called at trial, as well as a list of proposed exhibits, no later than **June 19, 2015**.
- b. Defendants and Intervenor-Defendants shall file a list of all witnesses intended to be called at trial, as well as a list of proposed exhibits, no later than **June 22, 2015**.
- c. Any objections to exhibits shall be filed with the Clerk no later than **June 25, 2015**.
- d. Each Party shall deliver to the Clerk four sets of pre-marked, indexed exhibits on **July 6, 2015**.

#### **13. Trial Briefs**

Each Party shall file a trial brief with the Clerk no later than **June 26, 2015**.

#### **14. Trial Date**

Trial is scheduled to commence on **July 7, 2015** at 10:00 a.m. at the Albert V. Bryan United States Courthouse located at 401 Courthouse Square, Alexandria, VA 22314.

//

Dated: February 12, 2015

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/Anthony F. Troy (by JKR with permission)

Anthony F. Troy  
VSB No. 05985  
ECKERT SEAMANS CHERIN &  
MELLOTT, LLC  
Eighth and Main Building Suite 1450  
707 East Main Street  
Richmond, VA 23219  
Tel: (804) 788-7740  
Fax: (804) 698-2950  
atroy@eckertseamans.com

By: /s/John K. Roche

John K. Roche  
VSB No. 68594  
PERKINS COIE, LLP 700 13th St. N.W.,  
Suite 600  
Washington, D.C. 20005-3960  
Phone: (202) 434-1627  
Fax: (202) 654-9106  
JRoche@perkinscoie.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

*Attorneys for Defendants*

By: /s/Katherine L. McKnight (by JKR with permission)

Jennifer M. Walrath (VSB No. 75548)  
Katherine L. McKnight (VSB No. 81482)  
E. Mark Braden (*pro hac vice*)  
BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP 1050 Connecticut Ave NW, Suite 1100  
Washington, DC 20036  
Tel: (202) 861-1500  
Fax: (202) 861-1783  
[mbraden@bakerloaw.com](mailto:mbraden@bakerloaw.com)  
[jwalrath@bakerlaw.com](mailto:jwalrath@bakerlaw.com)  
[kmcknight@bakerlaw.com](mailto:kmcknight@bakerlaw.com)

*Attorneys for the Virginia House of Delegates and Virginia House of Delegates Speaker William J. Howell*

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 12th day of February, 2015, I caused the foregoing to be electronically filed with the Clerk of this Court using the CM/ECF system, which will then send a notification of such filing (NEF) to the following:

Jeffrey P. Brundage  
Daniel Ari Glass  
Kathleen Angell Gallagher  
Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott LLC  
1717 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
Suite 1200  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
(202) 659-6600  
Fax: (202) 659-6699  
jbrundage@eckertseamans.com  
dglass@eckertseamans.com  
kgallagher@eckertseamans.com

Anthony F. Troy  
Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott LLC  
707 East Main Street  
Suite 1450  
Richmond, Virginia 23219  
(804) 788-7751  
Fax: (804) 698-2950  
ttroy@eckertseamans.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Virginia State Board  
of Elections, Virginia Department of Elections,  
and Charlie Judd, Kimberly Bowers, James B.  
Alcorn, and Edgardo Cortes in their official  
capacities*

Jennifer Marie Walrath  
Katherine Lea McKnight  
Baker & Hostetler LLP (DC)  
1050 Connecticut Ave NW  
Suite 1100  
Washington, DC 20036  
202-861-1702  
Fax: 202-861-1783  
jwalrath@bakerlaw.com  
kmcknight@bakerlaw.com

Efrem Mark Braden  
Baker & Hostetler LLP (DC-NA)  
Washington Square  
Suite 1100  
Washington, DC 20036  
202-861-1504  
Fax: 202-861-1783  
mbraden@bakerlaw.com

*Attorneys for Intervenor-Defendants Virginia  
House of Delegates and William J. Howell,  
Speaker of the House*

Respectfully submitted,

By/s/ John K. Roche

John K. Roche (VA Bar No. 68594)  
Perkins Coie LLP  
700 13th St., N.W., Suite 600  
Washington, D.C. 20005-3960  
Phone: (202) 434-1627  
Fax: (202) 654-9106  
JRoche@perkinscoie.com

*Attorney for Plaintiffs*